Teaching of the Holocaust as Part of a University's Catholic Identity

Gemma Del Duca, S.C., Ph.D.

Abstract

This article sketches the development of the National Catholic Center for Holocaust Education, Seton Hill University, Greensburg, PA. It does so with broad strokes, which paint a picture of the program of the Center within the context of ecclesial and papal activities and documents. The article describes how the Center entered into dialogue with the academic world of Holocaust studies (especially with the International School for Holocaust Studies, Yad Vashem, Jerusalem, Israel) and how it became engaged in an institute and in triennial conferences that prepare Catholic educators to teach the Holocaust by referencing Catholic documents on the Holocaust and on related topics such as antisemitism, ¹ racism, genocide, human rights, and interreligious dialogue. The work of the Holocaust Center has contributed to strengthening Seton Hill University's Catholic identity.

Introduction

In 1987 Seton Hill University in Greensburg, PA, launched a new and pioneering initiative: the National Catholic Center for Holocaust Education. The work of the Center realizes, in a dynamic way, the University's mission statement that Seton Hill is "a Catholic university rooted in Judeo-Christian values." Since the Second Vatican Council, the university community, like so many others, has been involved with the Church "in an effort to acknowledge and learn from past shortcomings and failures," especially in the area of Catholic-Jewish dialogue. In 1987,

Gemma Del Duca is Co-Director (Israel) of the National Catholic Center for Holocaust Education, Seton Hill University, Greensburg, PA.

¹ Unless spelled otherwise in a quoted source, *antisemitism* will be spelled as one word, which has become the norm in most academic writing.

² Seton Hill University Mission Statement, http://www.setonhill.edu/about/index.cfm.

³ Mark W. Roche, *The Intellectual Appeal of the Idea of a Catholic University* (Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2003), 2-3.

when Pope John Paul II visited the United States, he announced that one of his major goals was healing the relationship with the Jewish community. In a letter he wrote in August of that year to Archbishop John L. May, then president of the National Conference of Catholic Bishops (now the United States Conference of Catholic Bishops), the Holy Father wrote movingly of the importance of the Holocaust: "Reflection upon the Shoah shows us to what terrible consequences the lack of faith in God and a contempt for man created in his image can lead. It also impels us to promote the necessary historical and religious studies on this event which concerns the whole of humanity today."⁴ Although this was not the first time that John Paul II had spoken on the importance of the Holocaust for Catholics—he had also addressed the topic at Auschwitz (1979), Vienna (1983), and Rome (1986)⁵—these inspiring words seemed to have urged Seton Hill University to move forward with the Holocaust Center; indeed, the Center provided the University with a means to respond to the Pope's challenge with a commitment to study, to research, and to develop activities around this horrific time in history.

From the beginning, the goal of the Center was to engage educators at Catholic institutions, especially at Catholic colleges and universities, in study of the Holocaust so that they might bring this to bear "in shaping appropriate curricular responses for students of every age." This article looks at the Center's almost twenty-five years of experience in study, dialogue, programming, and teaching and presents the ways in which the Center strengthens the Catholic identity of Seton Hill University.

Beginning with an Idea

The Center was formally established in November 1987 with a commemoration of *Kristallnacht* (the "Night of Broken Glass"). This event occurred first on November 9-10, 1938, when the state-inspired antisemitism of Nazi Germany resulted in the burning of some 200 synagogues. Each year since 1987, the Center has marked the anniversary with an

⁴ Secretariat for Catholic-Jewish Relations of the National Conference of Catholic Bishops, *John Paul II on the Holocaust* (Washington, DC: National Conference of Catholic Bishops, 1988), 9.

⁵ Secretariat, John Paul II on the Holocaust, 3-5.

^{5a} Seton Hill University, National Catholic Center for Holocaust Education Mission Statement. See under "About," www.setonhill.edu/centers/ncche.cfm (accessed November 3, 2011).

interfaith service where students of all beliefs gather with survivors and the local community to remember the horrors of this event in word, psalm, music, and reflection. Launching the Center with this event raised the flag for an important new endeavor of Seton Hill University locally.

The year 1987 marked the inauguration of JoAnne Boyle, Ph.D., as the ninth president. Early in August of that year, a visitor from Israel, Sister Gemma Del Duca, S.C., (member of the Sisters of Charity, the congregation who had founded Seton Hill College in 1918) approached the new president with a new idea. Her proposal was to establish, in Israel, Seton Hill University's Catholic Institute for Holocaust Studies. The institute would focus on providing educators, especially those in Catholic colleges and universities across the United States (of which there were about 220 at the time), with the tools necessary to enter into serious discussion and teaching on the causes of antisemitism and the Holocaust. With such preparation, educators could then return to their respective institutions prepared to shape curricular responses that would begin to develop a program of Holocaust awareness and education. Support of some of the faculty was sought and obtained to formulate the idea; however, the greatest assistance was provided by Sister Mary Noel Kernan, S.C. She had been with Sr. Gemma in Israel and helped provide the firsthand knowledge of Israel necessary to construct a draft proposal for Dr. Boyle. When she returned to Israel, Sister Gemma had the responsibility to find the proper location for the Catholic Institute for Holocaust Studies. Shalmi Barmore, then director of education at Yad Vashem, the Holocaust Martyrs' and Heroes' Remembrance Authority of Israel, located in Jerusalem, was intrigued with the idea and offered support. This was the place par excellence for the institute, which would become the National Catholic Center for Holocaust Education's (NCCHE⁶) base for its international program.

The institute, however, needed a structure; therefore, under the direction of Sister Mary Noel in consultation with President Boyle, a "center" model began to take shape at Seton Hill University. A board of scholars (especially persons involved in Catholic-Jewish dialogue) and business and community leaders was recruited to advise the center. Bishop Anthony G. Bosco (now retired) of the Diocese of Greensburg, and Cardinal Donald W. Wuerl, then bishop of the Diocese of Pittsburgh, served as honorary members of the Center's advisory board from the beginning. Monetary support, which was needed to cover operation of the Center

 $^{^{6}}$ NCCHE, National Catholic Center for Holocaust Education, will be used to designate the Center.

and scholarships for educators who would attend the institute in Israel, came from a variety of sources. Early support came from the Congregation of the Sisters of Charity who have continued this support. Former and present members of the board of trustees of the University gave personal and financial support. Support also came from hundreds of family members, friends, alumni, and interested persons who sent both large and small donations to support the work.

Until her retirement in 1996, Sister Noel, with limited funds, equipment, and student assistance, managed the Center at Seton Hill. She worked to recruit for the summer program in Israel and also spent time promoting the Center on campus, in the local community, and nationally by attending and participating in national conferences related to the Holocaust. In Israel, Sister Gemma remained involved in several ways. She served as the liaison with the International School for Holocaust Studies at Yad Vashem, co-ordinated the Catholic Institute for Holocaust Studies, did study and research on the Holocaust, and maintained contacts with scholars in the field, especially those who now served on the NCCHE advisory board.

The work and scope of the Center, whether on the local, national, or international stage, has required study of the Church documents and, in particular, involvement in the Catholic-Jewish dialogue that has given a special purpose and inspiration to the Center's task. This dialogue has required that we forge strong ties with the Jewish community, especially because of our close relationship with survivors of the Holocaust. In what has developed into a rich cultural and religious exchange, we have also had to keep our focus on Church history and teaching, Papal pronouncements, statements, actions, and efforts to be faithful and honest to our mission. Thus, through this dialogue, we could experience

⁷ In 1996 Sister Lois Sculco, Vice President for Mission and Student Life, became the administrative liaison for the Center with Sister Gemma as co-director (from her location in Israel); Wilda Kaylor became associate director and there was more involvement of student interns and volunteers.

⁸ The word "mission" here refers to the mission statement of Seton Hill University which describes Seton Hill as a Catholic university rooted in Judeo-Christian values. The NCCHE supports these values through scholarship, education, and dialogue: "The mission of the National Catholic Center for Holocaust Education is to counter antisemitism and to foster Catholic-Jewish relations by making the fruits of Holocaust scholarship accessible to educators at every level, especially in Catholic colleges and universities throughout the United States. To this end the Center sustains a vital cooperative program with Yad Vashem in Israel and designs events to assist educators in shaping appropriate curricular responses for students of every age."

our "Catholic identity" in the reality of changing events within the Church and within the Jewish community.

Studying Church Documents

At the Center, we have regularly turned our attention to Nostra Aetate, 1965, the Second Vatican Council's statement on non-Christian relations, by holding lectures, classes, and programs of special interest to faculty and students. Without this document, a center such as ours could not exist in a Catholic college or university. In this short statement, the Catholic Church solemnly declared: "The Jews remain close to God... since God does not take back the gifts he bestowed or the choice he made." 9,10 Later, the fourth section of the document, which addresses Judaism and the Jewish people, removed the substitution theory and made it clear that "neither Jews indiscriminately," nor "Jews today can be charged with the crimes committed during Christ's passion." As Cardinal Edward Cassidy has pointed out, "Jews should not therefore be spoken of as rejected or accursed as if this follows from Holy Scripture."¹² Having addressed the charges of "deicide," this document began what would be the Church's official stand against antisemitism: "[The Church] decries hatred, persecutions, displays of anti-Semitism, directed against Jews at any time and by anyone." This position was strengthened by the 1975 Guidelines: "The spiritual bonds and historical links binding the Church to Judaism condemn (as opposed to the very spirit of Christianity) all forms of antisemitism and discrimination." ¹⁴ In 1985, *Notes* on the Correct Way to Present the Jews and Judaism in Preaching and

⁹ Deleted.

¹⁰ Edward Idris Cardinal Cassidy, "Nostra Aetate Revisited," in Examining Nostra Aetate After 40 Years, ed. Anthony J. Cernera (Fairfield, CT: Sacred Heart University Press, 2007), 1-2.

¹¹ Second Vatican Council, Nostra Aetate: Declaration on the Relationship of the Church to Non-Christian Religions, http://www.ccjr.us/dialogika-resources/documents-and-statements/roman-catholic/second-vatican-council/293-nostra-aetate (accessed September 27, 2011), section 4.

¹² Cassidy, "Nostra Aetate Revisited," 2.

¹³ Second Vatican Council, *Nostra Aetate*, http://www.ccjr.us/dialogika-resources/documents-and-statements/roman-catholic/second-vatican-council/293-nostra-aetate (accessed September 27, 2011), section 4.

¹⁴ Pope Paul VI, *Guidelines and Suggestions for Implementing the Conciliar Document "Nostra Aetate"* (N. 4), http://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/pontifical_councils/chrstuni/relations-jews-docs/rc_pc_chrstuni_doc_19741201_nostra-aetate_en.html (accessed January 28, 2011), Preamble, ¶5.

Catechesis in the Roman Catholic Church brought the issue directly into the realm of education:

The urgency and importance of precise, objective, and rigorously accurate teaching on Judaism for our faithful follows too from the danger of antiSemitism [sic] which is always ready to appear under different guises. The question is not merely to uproot from among the faithful the remains of antiSemitism [sic] still to be found here and there, but much rather to arouse in them, through educational work, an exact knowledge of the wholly unique "bond" (Nostra Aetate, 4) which joins us as a Church to the Jews and to Judaism. ¹⁵

Three years later, the document, "The Church and Racism," was published. It included several sections discussing anti-Judaism (#2) and antisemitism (#'s 7, 15 and 20). ¹⁶ As educators the Center had to recognize that unfortunately antisemitism had not disappeared, despite the fact that, as the document indicated, it had been the most tragic racist ideology of the twentieth century.

All this background education and preparation¹⁷ was necessary if we were to accomplish what was written in our mission statement "to counter antisemitism and to foster Catholic-Jewish relations by making the fruits of Holocaust scholarship accessible to educators at every level..."

Educating the Educators

While the Center has, from the beginning, offered learning opportunities for students, the Center decided early on to reach out to the

¹⁵ Pope John Paul II, *Notes on the Correct Way to Present the Jews and Judaism in Preaching and Catechesis in the Roman Catholic Church*, http://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/pontifical_councils/chrstuni/relations-jews-docs/rc_pc_chrstuni_doc_19820306_jews-judaism_en.html (accessed January 28, 2011), Religious Training and Judaism, ¶8.

 $^{^{16}}$ Mary C. Boys, Has God Only One Blessing? Judaism as a Source of Christian Self-Understanding (New York: Paulist Press, 2000), 256. Pontifical Justice and Peace Commission, "The Church and Racism: Towards a More Fraternal Society (excerpts)," http://www.ccjr.us/dialogika-resources/documents-and-statements/roman-catholic/vatican-curia/291-pjpc-1988 (accessed September 27, 2011), Part I, § 2, 7; Part II, § 15; Part III, § 20.

¹⁷ Study and understanding of *Nostra Aetate* (1965) and the documents that followed in 1975, 1985, and 1988 were an important body of material that could be used by staff, faculty, students, and others for educational work and for dialogue.

¹⁸ Seton Hill University, National Catholic Center for Holocaust Education Mission Statement. See under "About," www.setonhill.edu/centers/ncche.cfm (accessed November 3, 2011).

University's faculty in a special way. In so doing, the Center attempted to bring this message of healing to all aspects of the University's academic life, for "if antisemitism has been the most tragic form that racist ideology has assumed in our century, with the horrors of the Jewish 'Holocaust,' it has unfortunately not yet entirely disappeared." ¹⁹

Today, the National Catholic Center for Holocaust Education provides opportunities for educators to learn the importance of Holocaust studies and how to integrate the topic into course programming. For instance, in the summer of 1989, the Catholic Institute for Holocaust Studies seminar took place in Israel in co-operation with the education department of Yad Vashem, the official memorial site for the Holocaust in Jerusalem, Israel, which also housed its world-renowned library and archives. As mentioned, this institute was established to shape how topics such as antisemitism and the Holocaust were presented in Catholic colleges and universities, to bring a Catholic perspective to these studies, and to find ways to give these topics a stronger standing in the mainstream curriculum.

Seton Hill University president Dr. Boyle wrote to the presidents of every Catholic college and university in the United States, inviting them to send a representative to participate in this institute. Placing the institute at the International School for Holocaust Studies, located at Yad Vashem, offered a unique experience: while studying this dark chapter in Jewish history, the participants also had the opportunity to interact with the living and vibrant people of Israel—teachers, staff, young students, soldiers, and especially the Holocaust survivors who frequent Yad Vashem daily. This is now an annual program, held in co-operation with Yad Vashem. Thus the original idea around which the NCCHE was established has borne fruit. From the beginning, it was the dream and hope of the founders²⁰ to educate the educators.

Academic Outreach

The NCCHE also reaches out to educators by offering academic conferences with speakers on topics related to Holocaust education. For example, a few months before the Center sent the first group to the Catholic Institute for Holocaust Studies at Yad Vashem, the first of what

 $^{^{19}}$ Boys, $Has~God~Only~One~Blessing?~256. "The Church and Racism," http://www.ccjr.us/dialogika-resources/documents-and-statements/roman-catholic/vatican-curia/291-pjpc-1988 (accessed September 26, 2011), Part II, <math display="inline">\P$ 15.

²⁰ Founders are Sister Gemma Del Duca, S.C., and Sister Mary Noel Kernan, S.C.

was to be the triennial Holocaust education conference took place. The keynote speaker at this first conference, held on April 6-7, 1989, was Elie Wiesel, 1986 Nobel Peace Laureate and survivor of Auschwitz and Buchenwald. This conference established the Center as a "national" location for Holocaust studies. Two of the presentations were given by leading scholars in Jewish-Catholic relations: Dr. Eugene Fisher, who asked and responded directly to the question "Why Teach the Holocaust?" and Father Michael McGarry, C.S.P., who concretized the teaching task by addressing "Obstacles and Opportunities: Practical Considerations in Teaching the Holocaust."

Thus, the Center quickly became a source for interdisciplinary research, study, and learning for faculty, students, and outside visitors. To give continuity to our narrative related to development of Holocaust education and Catholic-Jewish dialogue, the two-pronged mission of the Center, we will continue our narrative with special emphasis on our conferences, connecting them with the continuing educational development and experience of faculty and teachers within the Catholic educational system.

In October of 1991, at its second conference, the Center gave its first Nostra Aetate award for leadership in Catholic-Jewish Relations. The first recipient was Father Edward H. Flannery, author of the now classic work, The Anguish of the Jews: Twenty-three Centuries of Antisemitism. In the opening address, Fr. Flannery presented a history of the three waves of anti-Zionism and antisemitism that occurred in the twentieth century. The first wave included the pogroms in Russia and the Dreyfus Affair in France at the end of the nineteenth and into the beginning of the twentieth century; the second, which occurred in the middle of the twentieth century, included the unparalleled atrocities of Nazism; now a third wave began to gain fresh vigor under the guise of anti-Zionism. As in his book, Father Flannery noted that anti-Zionism and antisemitism are not synonymous, 21 and that while theoretically one could be anti-Zionist without being antisemitic, that was difficult to accomplish in practice. The consideration of anti-Zionism becomes important, since both the Nazi Holocaust and the emergence of Israel as a state had often elicited from Christians, Catholics included, attitudes of indifference, irritation, and even hostility. Because the Center was attempting to undertake Holocaust studies in a serious way, the link with Israel had to be made and experienced. Flannery seemed to echo this as

²¹ Edward H. Flannery, *The Anguish of the Jews: Twenty-three Centuries of Antisemitism* (New York: Paulist Press, 1985).

he urged the adoption of the Jewish agenda, divided into three major concerns: antisemitism, the Holocaust, and the State of Israel. He urged Christian scholars to pursue scholarly studies on the development of antisemitism as well as on the Holocaust and the significance of Israel from a Jewish-Christian perspective. Along with this, he added a pragmatic turn that John Paul II had recently espoused: the need to take the dialogues and meetings to the parishes, to the occupants in the pews, to the Christian people. The audience of faculty, students, and friends of the University were challenged to apply Father Flannery's words to their academic world of lectures, seminars, discussions, and even conversations.

Effects On and Off Campus

The Holocaust Center extended its influence to reach those both on and off campus. For instance, at the second conference, presenters concentrated on the topic of Holocaust education, and addressed topics such as "Pitfalls in Teaching the Shoah: Theological and Pedagogical Reflections," "Catholic Education Since 'Nostra Aetate," and "The Uniqueness of the Holocaust for Christians." A special feature of the second conference was that two of the presenters, who had been participants in the summer institute in Israel, explored how students reacted to the study of and personal struggle with the Holocaust. Using excerpts from student reflections, they demonstrated how the course of study affected the attitudes and beliefs of a diverse group of students. As these presenters had been a part of the cadre of faculty who had spent time at Yad Vashem, the success of that program was implicitly expressed in their findings.

By the early 1990s the Center had developed both a national and an international program, while also providing on-campus programs with speakers and special events: one on campus in the fall, the Kristallnacht interfaith service, and one off-campus in the spring, the *Yom HaShoah* (annual Holocaust Remembrance Day) commemoration with the local synagogue and churches. Other on-campus events included speakers, films, a Lenten observance program, and additional outreach to teachers from the local Greenburg and Pittsburgh dioceses.

²² Edward H. Flannery, "A Time for a Change of Direction?" in *At the Edge of the* 21st Century: Second Scholars' Conference on the Teaching of the Holocaust Proceedings (Greensburg, PA: Seton Hill University, 1991), 5-10.

Frequently, these programs were inspired by presentations given at the conferences. Each conference, moreover, seemed to mark a milestone. The annual program at Yad Vashem brought fresh insights into our approach at the Center, and the recognition of the State of Israel by the Holy See in 1993 brought renewed emphasis for Catholic-Jewish relations as related to Holocaust education. The Fundamental Agreement between the Holy See and the State of Israel²³ was an important document to add to required reading, especially for those who had been or who would be going to Israel for the Center's Catholic Institute for Holocaust Studies at Yad Vashem in Jerusalem.

Learning Through the Eyes of Holocaust Witnesses

Bringing the reality of the Holocaust to life through the Center is an important priority. The Center's third conference in 1995, entitled "A Scholars' Retreat on Claude Lanzmann's Film, Shoah," attempted to share the truths of the Holocaust from the perspective of witnesses. Through interviews with witnesses, the film Shoah enables the viewer to confront the seemingly unreal horror of the Holocaust. The retreat opened with a presentation by Jan Karski, the recipient of the Center's second Nostra Aetate award²⁴ and one of the key witnesses featured in the film. Six papers were published from this "retreat." One of the most original was by Andrew Charlesworth, who, taking his lead from Lanzmann, describes the film in topographic terms. Charlesworth concludes that "the interior of horror[,] for the most part[,] Lanzmann leaves on the exterior of the faces of the survivors and of the witnesses like Jan Karski....But once having entered the world of Shoah, nothing we go back to, a green field, a train, our comfortable homes, can ever be without a shadow."25 Jan Karski's presence and the impact of other witnesses in this powerful film made the educators realize the central

²³ Secretariat of State of the Holy See and the State of Israel, Fundamental Agreement between the Holy See and the State of Israel, http://www.ccjr.us/dialogika-resources/documents-and-statements/roman-catholic/vatican-curia/292-state-1993 (accessed September 27, 2011).

²⁴ This award, named for the Vatican II document (section four) concerning the relations between the Church and the Jewish People, was established by the NCCHE in 1991 to be given for leadership in Catholic-Jewish relations.

²⁵ Andrew Charlesworth, "A Whole New World? A Reflection on Claude Lanzmann's Shoah" in A Scholars' Retreat on Claude Lanzmann's Film, Shoah: Third Biennial Scholars' Conference on Holocaust Education Proceedings (Greensburg, PA: Seton Hill University, 1995), 29.

significance of survivors in the educational process. As the participants pondered how they had been changed by the insights of this film, the topic for the next conference was announced, "Holocaust Education: Approaches That Work."

Reconciliation

In September 1997, less than a month before this next conference, the Catholic bishops of France released a statement of repentance at Drancy, the deportation camp from which more than 70,000 Jews had been sent to their deaths. Dr. Eva Fleischner, the deeply committed Catholic theologian, scholar of the Holocaust, teacher, and leader in Holocaust education and in Jewish-Catholic dialogue was present for this remarkable event. As the Nostra Aetate award recipient at the Center's fourth conference, held on September 30, 1997, Dr. Fleischner shared her experience of having been in Paris as the French bishops asked forgiveness of the Jews for the silence of the French Church during the Holocaust. She explained that because of her work with Catholics who had saved Jews in France, she felt a special connection to the event. She noted that the Catholics she had interviewed, whether lay people, priests, or religious, all expressed sadness and even anger over the Church's silence during this terrible time. Except for a few bishops who spoke out (notably, in Toulouse and Montauban), the Church had remained silent, leaving the people with a feeling of abandonment. She spoke of the challenges in teaching the Holocaust, of the difficulty of putting the Holocaust into the context of Jewish history, and explained the role of the churches during the Nazi period in light of the nineteen centuries of Christian anti-Judaism that had prepared the soil for Hitler.²⁶ A distinction is made between anti-Judaism and antisemitism. Anti-Judaism is a theological term referring to attitudes, arguments, polemics, and actions based on the theological claim that Christians have replaced Jews as God's people because Jews did not accept Jesus. Antisemitism is a racist term to denote hostility and hatred toward Jews. She went on to explain that confronting the shadow of the students' faith tradition might overwhelm them with guilt, but that the teacher's challenge is to

²⁶ Eva Fleischner, "Challenges and Dangers in Teaching the Holocaust" in *Holocaust Education: Approaches That Work: Fourth Biennial Scholars' Conference of Holocaust Education Proceedings* (Greensburg, PA: Seton Hill University, 1997), 10.

transform this sense of guilt into a sense of responsibility for the present and for the future. 27

Having been a correspondent during the second session of the Second Vatican Council, Dr. Fleischner added a personal note regarding *Nostra Aetate*, which she called "the magna carta of the new era in Catholic-Jewish relations." She believed "the greatness of *Nostra Aetate* lies...as much in what it has made possible as in what it said in its few (16) terse Latin sentences." Her words confirmed the document's continued importance in the work of the Center.

During the conference there was a dynamic character in the presentations and responses, such as the one between Dr. Henry R. Huttenbach and Father John T. Pawlikowski, O.S.M. Father John both agreed and disagreed with Dr. Huttenbach: he "share[d]...Professor Huttenbach's passion that we do not accept easy roads to reconciliation" while insisting that the road to be taken be "built upon sound scholarship as well as personal experience." Conference participants who had graduated from the Catholic Institute for Holocaust Studies at Yad Vashem chaired and participated in lively, intellectual discussions, preparing them to make their own presentations at future conferences. Thus, the conferences also served as important opportunities for graduates of the summer program and others involved in Holocaust education to gather for learning, discussion, and networking.

Reflection on Document Opens Millennium Conference

The Center's fifth conference was held in the fall of 2000. Three years had elapsed since the fourth conference to allow more people to complete the program in Israel and to encourage greater participation. (The triennial conference continues as an ongoing feature of the Center.) The *Nostra Aetate* award was presented to Dr. Judith Hershcopf Banki, Director of Special Programs for the Tanenbaum Center for Interreligious Understanding, and a pioneer in shaping the nature and meaning of interreligious dialogue and relations in the United States. In her remarks, Dr. Banki reviewed the reception of *We Remember: A Reflection on the Shoah*, which had been published two years before.

²⁷ Ibid., 11.

²⁸ Ibid., 17.

²⁹ Mary Noel Kernan, S.C., introduction to *Holocaust Education: Approaches That Work: Fourth Biennial Scholars' Conference of Holocaust Education Proceedings* (Greensburg, PA: Seton Hill University, 1997), 3.

When John Paul II was in the United States in 1987, the Center's first year, he had promised "a Catholic document" concerning the *Shoah* and antisemitism. On March 16, 1998, the Commission for Religious Relations with the Jews published this long-awaited document, *We Remember: A Reflection on the Shoah.* While the document received mixed reviews in both the Jewish and Catholic communities, it is important to keep in mind that *We Remember* is addressed to "brothers and sisters of the Catholic Church throughout the world," and at the same time asks "all Christians to join us in meditating on the catastrophe which befell the Jewish people." In its conclusion, the document invites "all men and women of good will to reflect deeply on the significance of the *Shoah*.... To remember this terrible experience is to become fully conscious of the salutary warning it entails: the spoiled seeds of anti-Judaism and antisemitism must never again be allowed to take root in any human heart."

While Dr. Banki agreed that the document had weaknesses.³³ she focused on its strengths. She noted that, for the almost one billion Catholics in the world, it affirmed as "a major fact of history of this century" the murder of millions of Jews for the sole reason that they were Jews, and therefore, the document provided "a forthright rebuttal to what has become an entire industry of Holocaust denial and revision."34 To the members of the Catholic Church and to the world at large, the Church said, "It happened!" In addition, she showed how the document affirmed the religious roots of hostility to the Jews in "erroneous and unjust interpretations of the New Testament."36 This document, she asserted, "adds the Church's moral authority to the need to understand what gave rise to the greatest crime in the twentieth century and to remember it, 'for there is no future without memory." The "Reflection" of the Vatican was, in Judith Banki's opinion, "a rich field for further common study, and its expression of human solidarity should guide the footsteps of those who seek to develop its teaching and preaching

³⁰ Pope John Paul, II, "We Remember: A Reflection on the Shoah," http://www.vatican. va/roman_curia/pontifical_councils/chrstuni/documents/rc_pc_chrstuni_doc_16031998_ shoah_en.html (accessed January 28, 2011).

³¹ Ibid., I, ¶5.

³² Ibid., V, ¶4.

³³ Judith Herschcopf Banki, "Remarks," in *Children and the Holocaust: Fifth Holocaust Education Conference Proceedings* (Greensburg, PA: Seton Hill University, 2000), 17.

³⁴ Banki, "Remarks," 18.

³⁵ Ibid.

³⁶ Ibid.

³⁷ Ibid.

implications...'shaping a future in which the unspeakable iniquity of the *Shoah* will never again be possible."³⁸

Pope John Paul II Sets the Example

Two weeks later John Paul II made an important visit to Israel during which he placed a copy of that request for pardon in the Western Wall, a most sacred place for the Jewish world. On March 12, 2000, John Paul II presided over a special penitential service in St. Peter's Basilica, a day of pardon to ask forgiveness from the Lord "for the sins, past and present, of the sons and daughters of the Church."39 One of the requests for pardon referred to "Sins against the People of Israel." Two weeks later, John Paul II placed a copy of that request for pardon in the Western Wall, a most sacred place for the Jewish world. He stood in silent prayer before what remains of the Temple in Jerusalem. On this visit to Israel, John Paul II also visited Yad Vashem, the Hall of Remembrance, and rekindled the flame that recalls the six million victims of the *Shoah*, thereby sending this message to the world: "Men, women, and children cry out to us from the depths of the horror that they knew. How can we fail to hear their cry? No one can forget or ignore what happened. No one can diminish its scale. We wish to remember. But we wish to remember for a purpose—namely to ensure that never again will evil prevail, as it did for the millions of innocent victims of Nazism."41

These two actions, requesting pardon and the visit to Yad Vashem, were important for our Center as "Catholic" and as concerned with Holocaust education. From the beginning, Holocaust education was part of the larger picture of Catholic-Jewish relations at the Center, and as such, our educational work had a much wider context which touched our lives not only through the work of dialogue but on many deeply human and deeply spiritual levels. By his personal example during this visit to Israel, John Paul II affirmed us in our work as Holocaust educators and challenged us to remember for a purpose that evil will not prevail either in the present or in the future.

³⁸ Ibid.

³⁹ Cassidy, "Nostra Aetate Revisited," 13.

⁴⁰ Ibid.

⁴¹ Ibid., 15.

The Shoah and Catholic Education

The Center next directed its focus on creating a new generation of Catholic school educators shaped by Holocaust education. The theme of the 2003 conference, "Teaching the Holocaust in Catholic Schools," reflected the desire to examine, in a special way, directives from the Holy See and the document Catholic Teaching on the Shoah, approved by the U.S. Catholic Bishops in 2001. Educators from Catholic middle schools, high schools, colleges, and universities from fifteen different American states and from Canada presented papers. As it was the twenty-fifth anniversary of the pontificate of John Paul II, a dedication was given for his outstanding work in calling all to remember the Holocaust and promoting Holocaust education. Five nationally known Catholic teachers and lecturers on the Holocaust and Jewish-Catholic Relations presented lectures; Mary C. Boys, S.N.J.M., with her years of personal experience in dialogue and research, provided the keynote address. 42 Among the 150 participants, 45 educators presented a wide range of issues from pedagogical to curricular issues. The seventeen published papers in the proceedings were divided into three sections: the college and university level, the secondary and elementary level, and the theological dimensions of Holocaust study in Catholic settings.

As the conference took place two years after the tragedy of September 11, 2001, one of the presenters encouraged reading scripture in fellowship with Jewish and other neighbors, including Muslims. William Young saw this as a way to "accomplish what Augustine sought in *De Doctrina*—a hermeneutic that promotes love of God and love of neighbor, undoing the tendency toward self-love (amor sui) that destroys peace and justice." As the participants made their way to the Kristallnacht Service that marked the closing of the conference, they were left with numerous ideas for devising new ways to help their students choose life and take up roles of responsibility and leadership in an increasingly global system. Father John Pawlikowski raised the question, "Has Christian education responded adequately to the fundamental moral

⁴² Mary C. Boys is the Skinner and McAlpin Professor of Practical Theology at Union Theological Seminary in New York City. She is a well known author and lecturer in Catholic-Jewish relations and her books include *Has God Only One Blessing?*; *Biblical Interpretation in Religious Education, Educating in Faith: Maps and Visions*, and *Jewish-Christian Dialogue: One Woman's Experience*.

⁴³ William W. Young, III, "Reading and Remembering on Christian Teaching after the Holocaust," in *Teaching the Holocaust in Catholic Schools: Sixth Holocaust Education Conference Proceedings* (Greenburg, PA: Seton Hill University, 2005), 165.

challenges posed by the Holocaust?" This set the theme for the next gathering. 44

40th Anniversary of Nostra Aetate

In the spring of 2005, friends, faculty, and students gathered to commemorate the fortieth anniversary of *Nostra Aetate* and to celebrate the *chai* (the Hebrew word consists of two letter with the numerical value of 18), the eighteenth year of the Center. Although event organizers were saddened by the death of John Paul II, they decided to host the event as a way to honor the memory of the Pope who had done so much to urge Catholics to remember the *Shoah*. The Rev. John T. Pawlikowski, O.S.M, professor of social ethics and director of the Catholic-Jewish Studies program in the Cardinal Bernardin Center at Catholic Theological Union in Chicago, was the recipient of the *Nostra Aetate* Award. As a member of the Center's advisory board who then served as its chair, Fr. Pawlikowski was a "wonderful resource to both the center and the university."

His remarks on, "The Uniqueness of *Nostra Aetate*: A Theological About-Face," became one of the Center's publications due to the importance of the message and marked this fortieth anniversary. He focused primarily on Chapter 4 of the document, the chapter that redefined the Church's relationship with the Jewish people, noting that both the fields of theology and liturgy still needed focused effort to incorporate Church statements on Catholic-Jewish relations into the mainstream of theological thinking and liturgical practice. Encouragingly, he proposed that forty years of rethinking is a short period of time when considering the two millennia of negative theology abrogated by Vatican II. Toward the end of his remarks, he called attention to the need for enhancing the encounter with a trilateral dialogue with Islam as well as with Buddhist, Hindu, and the Jain communities. In the globalized world, interreligious dialogue is not confined to the realm of theologians; it impacts the lives of people and the whole human community.⁴⁶

⁴⁴ John T. Pawlikowski, O.S.M., "The Holocaust: The Continuing Challenge for Catholic Education" in *Teaching the Holocaust in Catholic Schools: Sixth Holocaust Education Conference Proceedings* (Greensburg, PA: Seton Hill University, 2005), 33-36.

⁴⁵ JoAnne Boyle, President, Foreword to *Fifth Nostra Aetate Award* (Greensburg, PA: Seton Hill University, 2006), vi.

⁴⁶ John T. Pawlikowski, O.S.M., "The Uniqueness of Nostra Aetate: A Theological About Face" in *Fifth Nostra Aetate Award* (Greensburg, PA: Seton Hill University, 2006), 1-16.

Genocide after the Shoah

A year later, in 2006, the seventh Holocaust education conference took up the topic of "Emerging Issues in Holocaust Education." This conference reflected the progress and expansion in Holocaust studies throughout the Catholic educational system, from secondary schools through colleges and universities; eighteen states were represented, as were Israel and Poland. Two organizations used the occasion to hold their meeting in conjunction with the conference (one state, one national). The growth over the past decade in the study of comparative genocide was reflected in the proceedings, which began with the keynote address by Dr. Carol Rittner, R.S.M. In her paper, "Rape, Religion, and Genocide: An Unholy Silence," she showed that what was considered "war's dirty secret" during the Holocaust had become the weapon of choice in contemporary genocides. Then, as she documented the Church's condemnation of war and ethnic cleansing, she revealed its failure to condemn sexualized violence.

The first section of the proceedings from the conference demonstrated how Holocaust research contributes to the understanding of other genocides and how the study of other genocides enhances the understanding of the *Shoah* as a paradigm for the study of genocide. The second section of the proceedings moved to the new pedagogies needed for a generation that will not benefit from contact with survivors of the Holocaust. Effective and emerging pedagogies—using theater, photography, art, computer, video game model, modified simulation, and projectbased learning—were the focus of section three. Finally, in the last section, papers described Holocaust studies in a global context, which investigated the rise in new and old currents of antisemitism, the significance of two papal visits to Auschwitz, and looked at Holocaust education in Eastern Europe—something largely ignored until the 1980s, but now on the rise due to the emergence of the European Union and globalization. The conference captured the enthusiasm and creativity of teachers in Catholic institutions for developing new pedagogical approaches for Holocaust studies in an age of globalization. It also showed the evolution in Holocaust scholarship around the world, always with the hope of capturing the minds and hearts of a new generation to work toward understanding, respect, and reconciliation, all of which are fostered through interreligious dialogue and Catholic-Jewish relations.

Holocaust Study Crucial in Dialogue

In 2008 the Center honored Dr. Eugene J. Fisher, Catholic-Jewish relations scholar, teacher par excellence, and loyal spokesperson of the

American Bishops on Catholic-Jewish matters. For three decades, he had served as Associate of the Secretariat for Ecumenical and Interreligious Affairs. He had also been present at the Center's first advisory board meeting in 1988 and helped it to focus on Holocaust education for Catholic colleges and universities. The Center honored Dr. Fisher for his honesty and for his theological insights, both of which helped the Center survive through its early years, as well as for his work around the world in implementing *Nostra Aetate*.

Dr. Fisher observed that 2008 marked the seventieth anniversary of *Kristallnacht* and the sixtieth anniversary of the State of Israel. In good Jewish tradition, he extended "a very hearty *mazel tov* to the State of Israel....And the same also to the Jewish people, along with our profound gratitude, for being able to create a State of Israel in their ancient homeland 60 years ago, despite what happened 70 years ago and in the years between Kristallnacht and 1945: terrible years—eruption of evil into human history of proportions perhaps never seen before in history."

During the question and answer period, Dr. Fisher predicted that "there will still be volatility around the Holocaust." Still, he recognized that progress had been made because of centers like ours and institutes of Christian-Jewish relations in the United States, Europe, and Australia, which have been crucial for long-term Catholic-Jewish relations. Despite the progress, Dr. Fisher saw the Holocaust as casting a shadow on the dialogue for decades, if not generations.

The Shoah was such a trauma for Jews, and such a source of still not entirely confronted guilt for Christians, that it will continue to be a block between our communities which only in-depth dialogue can begin to bridge. Catholics need to understand where Jews are coming from with regard to the Holocaust. Only then can Catholics and Jews together begin to delve into its myriad implications for all of humanity.⁴⁹

The experience of hearing and meeting a scholar who had spent his life in the work of Catholic-Jewish relations, which included in depth study of the Holocaust, encouraged faculty and students to continue the work of dialogue, study, and research. For those who could not be there, the published address is part of the Center's special publications.

⁴⁷ Eugene J. Fisher, "Nostra Aetate in Historical and Future Context," in Sixth Nostra Aetate Award (Greensburg, PA: Seton Hill University, 2010), 5.

⁴⁸ Ibid., 15.

⁴⁹ Ibid., 18.

New Initiative: On-Line

From 2007-2008, with a critical mass of faculty and administrators having completed the Center's Summer Institute at Yad Vashem in Israel, the Seton Hill University faculty initiated a Genocide and Holocaust Studies Program. This new program features courses offered entirely on-line and includes an undergraduate minor and a graduate certificate. The graduate certificate is targeted toward educators teaching the Holocaust who need additional training and understanding of the many issues involved in studying and teaching the Holocaust. Because of its on-line format, students could participate from anywhere in the United States or in the world. This program influenced the Center's next conference in that "other genocides" would receive a greater emphasis within the programming.

Learn. Teach. Prevent.

The theme of the Ethel LeFrak⁵¹ Holocaust Education Conference (eighth conference) in the fall of 2009 was "Holocaust Education in the 21st Century: Religious and Cultural Perspectives." While the year marked the seventieth anniversary since the outbreak of World War II and was the occasion of a special papal visit by Pope Benedict XVI to Israel and to Yad Vashem, it began with the controversy over the comments of Bishop Richard Williamson, a member of the Society of St. Pius X, who publicly questioned the truth of the Holocaust in a television interview. Thus, at this conference, hearing Victoria Barnett point out the significance of symbolic acts as well as documents in interreligious dialogue was important. 52 She also warned of the stumbling blocks "that arise when history is taken off the table—when the lessons of the Church's history during the Holocaust are bypassed, when antisemitism is tolerated or ignored." The keynote speaker, Michael Berenbaum, challenged participants with the "central religious issue of our age" and its political overtones: "Can we embrace fundamentalism within our

 $^{^{50}}$ From 1989 to 2009 Seton Hill had 5 administrators and 17 faculty members who had attended the institute.

 $^{^{51}\,\}mathrm{The}$ 2009 Holocaust Education Conference was made possible by benefactor Ethel LeFrak.

⁵² Victoria J. Barnett, "Interreligious Dialogue since the Holocaust: Turning Points and Next Steps," in *Learn. Teach. Prevent.: Holocaust Education in the 21st Century*, ed. Carol Rittner, R.S.M. (Greensburg, PA: Seton Hill University, 2010), 21.

own tradition and still accept the 'other' as 'brother/sister?"⁵³ "Catholicism and Human Rights in the Light of the Shoah," presented by Father John Pawlikowski, clearly and honestly addressed this issue within the Catholic tradition.⁵⁴

In particular, this conference broke new ground with the screening of 40 Years of Silence: An Indonesian Tragedy, by film director and anthropologist Robert Lemelson, who took participants to another part of our earth, another time, and to another culture and people. Three panelists assisted the audience with understanding these 1965-66 murders within the context of genocide, while making it clear that some scholars would prefer to use the terms "Indonesian massacres," "mass killings," "politicide" or simply "the Indonesian killings of 1965-66." The film itself, as one of the panelists observed, emerges from the director's "psychocultural" research in Indonesia. Lemelson sets up a valuable tool for exploring the complicated issues surrounding events little understood in the West, the genocidal murder of up to one million Indonesians from the islands of Java and Bali in 1965-66. 56 Afterward, to make the connection between this "genocide" and the Holocaust and other genocides. the question was asked, "Is prejudice a prelude to genocide?" The response came in the simple statement that mass murder begins "in the minds and hearts of men and women."58

Dr. Carol Rittner, R.S.M., who edited the conference proceedings, wrote that "... the message of the conference was clear: **Learn** the lessons of the past. **Teach** a new generation. **Prevent** such things from

⁵³ Michael Berenbaum, "The Memory of the Holocaust: Challenges to Twenty-First Century Christians and Jews," in *Learn. Teach. Prevent.*, ed. C. Rittner, R.S.M. (Greensburg, PA: Seton Hill University, 2010), 25.

⁵⁴ John T. Pawlikowski, O.S.M., "Catholicism and Human Rights in Light of the *Shoah*" in *Learn. Teach. Prevent.*, ed. C. Rittner, R.S.M. (Greensburg, PA: Seton Hill University, 2010), 67.

⁵⁵ James G. Paharik, "40 Years of Silence in the Context of Shuharto's Brutal Reign" in *Learn. Teach. Prevent.*, ed. C. Rittner, R.S.M. (Greensburg, PA: Seton Hill University, 2010), 294.

⁵⁶ Michael Cary, "A Review of Robert Lemelson's Film 40 Years of Silence: An Indonesian Tragedy" in *Learn. Teach. Prevent.*, ed. C. Rittner, R.S.M. (Greensburg, PA: Seton Hill University, 2010), 303.

⁵⁷ Carol Rittner, R.S.M., "40 Years of Silence: Some Comments for Discussion" in *Learn. Teach. Prevent.*, ed. C. Rittner, R.S.M. (Greensburg, PA: Seton Hill University, 2010), 310.

⁵⁸ Rittner quoting Goldhagen in "40 Years of Silence: Some Comments for Discussion" in *Learn. Teach. Prevent.*, ed. C. Rittner, R.S.M. (Greensburg, PA: Seton Hill University, 2010), 311.

happening again—to anyone, anywhere, at any time."⁵⁹ As Dr. JoAnne Boyle, President of Seton Hill University wrote:

From these outstanding scholars we have much to learn in the field of Holocaust education and Genocide Studies, but what is unique about this volume is that it is combined with the work of teachers who present the scholarship to their students. Their presentations indicate the impact they have on a new generation. What we find in this volume will alert and prepare all who take Holocaust education seriously to a new level of learning in how to face and to prevent racism, antisemitism, discrimination, ethnic conflict and expressions of hate. ⁶⁰

Mission and Identity

Through all of the aforementioned activities and conferences, the National Catholic Center for Holocaust Education directly addresses the Catholic mission and identity of Seton Hill University. That is:

Seton Hill is a Catholic university rooted in Judeo-Christian values. In the tradition of Elizabeth Ann Seton, we educate students to think and act critically, creatively, and ethically as productive members of society committed to transforming the world. 60a

First, the Center takes the Holocaust, the Shoah, as the focus of study and research within the context of Catholic history and identity.

Second, each year a group of Catholic educators, especially from Catholic colleges and universities, recruited through the Seton Hill University Center, attend the summer seminar at the International School for Holocaust Studies, Yad Vashem, in Jerusalem, Israel. With this learning experience gained from lectures, films, pedagogic workshops, survivor testimonies, and discussions, participants are equipped to initiate the study of the Holocaust into the curriculum through specific courses or by mainstreaming in existing courses.

⁵⁹ Carol Rittner R.S.M., "Learn. Teach. Prevent." in *Learn. Teach. Prevent.*, ed. C. Rittner, R.S.M. (Greensburg, PA: Seton Hill University, 2010), 2.

⁶⁰ JoAnne W. Boyle quoted on the back cover of "Learn. Teach. Prevent." in *Learn. Teach. Prevent.*, ed. C. Rittner, R.S.M. (Greensburg, PA: Seton Hill University, 2010).

^{60a} Seton Hill University, National Catholic Center for Holocaust Education Mission Statement. See under "About," www.setonhill.edu/centers/ncche.cfm (accessed November 3, 2011).

Third, the triennial conference brings scholars and educators from other Catholic colleges, universities, and middle and high schools to the Seton Hill University campus. Publications from these conferences, sent to the libraries of Catholic colleges and universities in the United States, bring together new thinking and creativity in the area of Holocaust education within the context of a religious, Catholic perspective.

Fourth, the Center publicizes and makes available to students, faculty on campus, faculty from other Catholic institutions, and the public, documents, ecclesial or papal, that have been written on the Holocaust or related topics such as racism, antisemitism, human rights, and interfaith dialogue, especially with the Jewish people. It also publishes proceedings from the conferences, occasional lectures, and a biannual newsletter.

Fifth, the Center organizes on-campus activities with both faculty and students in which both parties assume an active role in addressing current issues that arise around the Holocaust or related topics, sometimes through study, research, or programs such as *Kristallnacht* and *Yom HaShoah*.

Conclusion

Seton Hill University, through the Center, which is now in its twenty-fourth year, remains firm in its commitment to promote Holocaust education within the context of Catholic history and identity. The work of the Center is considered an integral part of Seton Hill's mission as a Catholic institution and university. Through the Center's activities, important lessons for bettering our world in a dynamic, tangible way are passed on to the next generation through dialogue with history, with documents, and, above all, with people: Holocaust survivors, Catholic leaders, scholars, professors, teachers, and each other.

The Center stands ready to offer assistance to any institution of Catholic higher education interested in taking up the challenge of *Nostra Aetate* and subsequent Church teaching through some form of Holocaust education. Each year tuition scholarships are available for Catholic college and university faculty members to attend the Catholic Institute for Holocaust Studies in Israel. This information can be obtained at www.setonhill.edu/centers/ncche.cfm. We are always available at ncche@setonhill.edu.